



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

April 27, 2004

Ms. Lisa M. Salinas
Custodian of Records
Baytown Police Department
3200 North Main Street
Baytown, Texas 77521

OR2004-3433

Dear Ms. Salinas:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 200384.

The Baytown Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to two specified incidents. You state that some information will be released but claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.114, 552.115, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

As a preliminary matter, you indicate that the some of the submitted information, which you have marked, was obtained by the department pursuant to a grand jury subpoena as the agent of the grand jury. Article 20.02 of the Code of Criminal Procedure provides for the secrecy of grand jury proceedings. This office has concluded that grand juries are not governmental bodies that are subject to chapter 552 of the Government Code, so that records that are within the actual or constructive possession of a grand jury are not subject to disclosure under chapter 552. *See* Open Records Decision No. 513 (1988). When an individual or entity acts at the direction of the grand jury as its agent, information prepared or collected by the agent is within the grand jury's constructive possession and is not subject to chapter 552. *Id.* at 3. Information that is not so held or maintained is subject to chapter 552 and may be withheld only if a specific exception to disclosure is applicable. *Id.* Thus, because the information at issue was obtained pursuant to a grand jury subpoena or at the direction of the grand jury, this information is in the custody of the department as agent of the grand jury and is not subject to disclosure under chapter 552. *Id.* at 4.

You assert that some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision" and encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. Federal regulations prohibit the release of criminal history record information ("CHRI") maintained in state and local CHRI systems to the general public. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21(c)(1) ("Use of criminal history record information disseminated to noncriminal justice agencies shall be limited to the purpose for which it was given."), (2) ("No agency or individual shall confirm the existence or nonexistence of criminal history record information to any person or agency that would not be eligible to receive the information itself."). Section 411.083 provides that any CHRI maintained by the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") is confidential. Gov't Code § 411.083(a). Similarly, CHRI obtained from the DPS pursuant to statute is also confidential and may only be disclosed in very limited instances. *Id.* § 411.084; *see also id.* § 411.087 (restrictions on disclosure of CHRI obtained from DPS also apply to CHRI obtained from other criminal justice agencies). However, the definition of CHRI does not include driving record information maintained by DPS under chapter 521 of the Transportation Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.082(2)(B). To the extent that the submitted documents contain CHRI that was obtained pursuant to these state and federal regulations, it must be withheld under section 552.101 as information made confidential by law.

You assert that the information in Exhibit C is excepted from disclosure under section 552.114 of the Government Code. Section 552.114 excepts from disclosure student records at an educational institution funded completely or in part by state revenue. This office generally applies the same analysis under section 552.114 and the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act of 1974 ("FERPA"). Open Records Decision No. 539 (1990). FERPA provides that no federal funds will be made available under any applicable program to an educational agency or institution that releases personally identifiable information (other than directory information) contained in a student's education records to anyone but certain enumerated federal, state, and local officials and institutions, unless otherwise authorized by the student's parent. *See* 20 U.S.C. § 1232g(b)(1). "Education records" means those records that contain information directly related to a student and are maintained by an educational agency or institution or by a person acting for such agency or institution. *Id.* § 1232g(a)(4)(A). We note that the department is not an educational agency or institution attended by students. Consequently, the information that you seek to withhold in Exhibit C is not an "education record" as defined by FERPA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 390 (1983). Accordingly, we conclude that FERPA is inapplicable to the information at issue, and it may not be withheld from the requestor on that basis. As you claim no other exceptions for this information, it must be released to the requestor.

You assert that the death certificates in Exhibit D are excepted from disclosure under section 552.115 of the Government Code. Section 552.115 provides that a birth or death record maintained by the bureau of vital statistics of the Texas Department of Health or a local registration official is excepted from required public disclosure except that "a death record is public information and available to the public on and after the 25th anniversary of

the date of death as shown on the record filed with the bureau of vital statistics or local registration official." Because section 552.115 only applies to a death certificate maintained by the bureau of vital statistics or local registration officials, the department may not withhold a death certificate pursuant to that provision. See Open Records Decision No. 338 (1982). As you claim no other exceptions for this information, it must be released.

You assert that portions of the remaining information are excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 1703.306 of the Occupations Code. Section 1703.306(b) provides that "[a] governmental agency that acquires information from a polygraph examination under this section shall maintain the confidentiality of the information." The department must withhold the polygraph examination information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 1703.306(b) of the Occupations Code.

You assert that portions of the remaining information are protected under the doctrine of common-law privacy. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976), *cert. denied*, 430 U.S. 931 (1977). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. 540 S.W.2d at 683.

In addition, this office has found that the following types of information are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy: an individual's criminal history when compiled by a governmental body, see Open Records Decision No. 565 (citing *United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749 (1989)), personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body, see Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990), some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses, see Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps), and identities of victims of sexual abuse, see Open Records Decision Nos. 440 (1986), 393 (1983), 339 (1982). We have marked the information that the department must withhold under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. Upon review, however, we determine that the remaining information you seek to withhold on this basis is either not highly intimate or embarrassing or is of legitimate interest to the public. Accordingly, this information may not be withheld under common-law privacy.

You assert that portions of the remaining information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 provides in pertinent part:

(a) Information is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

- (1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state;
- (2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state; or
- (3) a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or a local agency authorized to issue an identification document.

Gov't Code § 552.130. The department must withhold some of the information you have marked under section 552.130. We note, however, that section 552.130 does not encompass motor vehicle information that pertains exclusively to a deceased individual. *See* Open Records Decision No. 272 (1981). We also note that information relating to a driver's license and motor vehicle title or registration issued by another state or country may not be withheld under section 552.130. We have also marked additional information that the department must withhold under section 552.130.

You assert that portions of the remaining information are subject to section 552.136 of the Government Code. Section 552.136 provides in relevant part:

(a) In this section, "access device" means a card, plate, code, account number, personal identification number, electronic serial number, mobile identification number, or other telecommunications service, equipment, or instrument identifier or means of account access that alone or in conjunction with another access device may be used to:

- (1) obtain money, goods, services, or another thing of value; or
- (2) initiate a transfer of funds other than a transfer originated solely by paper instrument.

(b) Notwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.

Gov't Code § 552.136. The department must withhold the account number information we have marked pursuant to section 552.136 of the Government Code.

We note that some of the remaining information may be subject to section 552.117 of the Government Code. Section 552.117(a)(1) excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of current or

former officials or employees of a governmental body who timely elect to keep this information confidential pursuant to section 552.024. Whether a particular piece of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time the request for it is received by the governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Therefore, the department may only withhold information under section 552.117 on behalf of current or former officials or employees who elected to keep information confidential pursuant to section 552.024 prior to the date on which the request for this information was made. For those employees who timely elected to keep their personal information confidential, the department must withhold the employees' home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and any information that reveals whether these employees have family members. The department may not withhold this information under section 552.117 for those employees who did not make a timely election to keep the information confidential.

We also note that some of the remaining information may be subject to section 552.1175 of the Government Code. Section 552.1175 provides in part:

(b) Information that relates to the home address, home telephone number, or social security number of an individual to whom this section applies, or that reveals whether the individual has family members is confidential and may not be disclosed to the public under this chapter if the individual to whom the information relates:

- (1) chooses to restrict public access to the information; and
- (2) notifies the governmental body of the individual's choice on a form provided by the governmental body, accompanied by evidence of the individual's status.

Gov't Code § 552.1175(b). However, you do not inform this office, nor does any of the submitted information indicate, whether the individual whose information is at issue is a licensed peace officer who has notified the department of his election of confidentiality for this information in accordance with the above-cited subsections 552.1175(b)(1) and (2). *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision No. 678 (2003) (concluding that county voter registrar was authorized to release voter information made confidential under section 552.1175 to another governmental entity, but that transferred information would not be confidential in possession of transferee until recipient governmental entity receives a section 552.1175 notification). If the individual is a licensed peace officer who complies with section 552.1175(b), the department must withhold the information we have marked. If not, the information at issue may not be withheld under this exception.

Finally, we note that the social security numbers contained in the remaining information may be excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). *See* Open Records

Decision No. 622 (1994). These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained and maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* Because this federal provision is intended to protect the privacy interests of individuals, this provision does not encompass the social security number of a deceased individual. *See* Attorney General Opinion H-917 at 3-4 (1976); Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981). However, the remaining information contains other social security numbers that may be confidential under section 552.101 in conjunction with the federal law. We have no basis for concluding that any of the social security numbers in the remaining information are confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Public Information Act imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing the social security numbers, the department should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by it pursuant to any provision of law, enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

In summary, the information held by the department as an agent of the grand jury is not subject to disclosure under chapter 552. To the extent that the submitted documents contain CHRI that was obtained pursuant to state and federal regulations, it must be withheld under section 552.101 as information made confidential by law. The department must withhold the marked portions of the remaining information under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.136. The department may be required to withhold the information we have marked under sections 552.117 and 552.1175. The social security numbers that are contained in the remaining information and relate to living individuals may be confidential under federal law. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the

governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Amy D. Peterson
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

ADP/sdk

Ref: ID# 200384

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Laura Rogers
809 Henderson Street
Houston, Texas 77007
(w/o enclosures)